ORDER SHEET West Bengal Administrative Tribunal

Present.The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag &
The Hon'ble Dr. Subesh Kumar Das

Case No. OA - 387 of 2013

San	kar Prasad Pal Versus The State of	West Bengal & Ors.
Serial No. and date of order	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary.
1	2	3
20 11/03/2019	For the Applicant : Mr. S.N. Chattopadhya Ld. Advocate.	ay,
	For the State Respondent: Mrs. S. Agarwal, Ld. Advocate.	
	The applicant has prayed for direction upon	the
	respondents for release of leave salary for 108 da	ys,
	for giving five annual increments during the per	iod
	from June 01, 2008 to March 31, 2009 and grant	of
	benefit of Career Advancement Scheme in terms	of
	ROPA 2009 and also for refund of Rs. 52, 309/- wh	ich
	was deducted from retiring gratuity due to exce	ess
	payment of salary.	
	It appears from the materials on record that	the
	applicant retired from service on March 31, 2009 fr	om
	the establishment of the respondent no. 3.	On
	September 22, 2008 the Appellate Authority of	the
	applicant modified the order of punishment impos	sed
	on the applicant by the disciplinary authority.	It
	appears from the said order of the Appellate Author	rity
	that punishment for withholding the five increme	nts
	with cumulative effect from June 01, 2003 to June	01,
	2007 was restored w.e.f. June 01, 2008. Hav	ing
	emboldened by the fact of restoration of increme	ent
	which was previously withheld with cumulative eff	ect

ORDER SHEET – (Continuation)

Form No.

 $V_{\mathbf{S}}$

The State of West Bengal & Others.

Case No. **OA** - **387** of **2013**

Case No. OA –		
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal	Office action with date
date of order	with signature	and dated signature of parties when necessary.
1	2	3
	it is contended on behalf of the applicant that he is	
	entitled to get annual increment for five years and	
	benefit of Career Advancement Scheme in terms of	
	ROPA 2009. The state respondents have placed	
	documents in order to establish that fixation of pay of	
	the applicant was done by giving annual increment	
	w.e.f. June 01, 2008 as directed by the Appellate	
	Authority in the order dated September 28, 2008. The	
	reply of the state respondents further indicates that	
	benefit of Modified Career Advancement Scheme for	
	completion of 25 years of service was also given to the	
	applicant w.e.f. June 01, 2008. The applicant is	
	entitled to get leave salary for 69 days as reflected	
	from the entries made in the Service Book of the	
	applicant, which was paid to the applicant in due	
	course. The applicant has already received Pension,	
	Gratuity, Commuted value of pension and Leave	
	Salary to which the applicant was entitled. In view of	
	our above observation, we can safely hold that the	
	applicant is not entitled to get further benefit of Leave	
	Salary or annual increment or benefit of Career	
	Advancement Scheme as prayed by the applicant.	
	Now, the issue for consideration of the Tribunal	
	is whether the applicant is entitled to get refund of Rs.	
	3.1.3.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1	

52,309/- which was recovered from the retiring

gratuity of the applicant on the ground of excess

ORDER SHEET – (Continuation)

Form	No.

Sankar Prasad Pal

Vs

The State of West Bengal & Others.

Case No. **OA** - **387** of **2013** Serial No. and Order of the Tribunal Office action with date date of order with signature and dated signature of parties when necessary. 1 payment due to wrong fixation of pay. In view of the proposition of law laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme in paragraph 18 of the judgment of "State of Punjab v Rafig Masih" reported in (2015) 4 SCC 334, the applicant is entitled to get refund of Rs. 52, 309/which was recovered from the retiring gratuity on the ground of excess payment due to wrong fixation of pay, which was detected after retirement of the applicant from service. In view of our above observation, the respondent

2. Director Information, Department no. Information and Culture, Government of West Bengal is directed to refund Rs. 52, 309/- to the applicant within a period of 12 (twelve) weeks from the date of communication of the order. With the above direction, the original application stands disposed of.

Let a **Plain Copy** of the order be supplied to both parties.

> S. K. DAS MEMBER(A)

R. K. BAG MEMBER(J)

Csm